

STUDENT HANDOUT A

Kidney Transplant Case Study

Using the criteria listed, you are to select *one* patient for a kidney transplant. You are to assume that all suffer from equally urgent cases of kidney failure and that those who do not receive a transplant will die within the year.

CRITERIA: 1) the person's merit 2) their contribution to society (past or potential) 3) their ability to pay 4) their need 5) their age

Patient #1: Dr. M.

Forty-five year old physician with large inner-city practice. Had mild heart attack three years ago, but made good recovery and heart seems sound. No wife or children. Present yearly income: \$70,000. Potential lifetime earnings: \$994,095. Health insurance? Yes.

Patient #2: Bonnie T.

Twenty-four year old mother of two children. Active in community work. Red Cross, church. Plans to resume nursing career when children reach school age (4 years). Yearly income now: (Husband's \$32,000). Her potential lifetime earnings: \$327,003. Health insurance? Yes.

Patient #3: Fred S.

Third year medical student, doing well and considered "of great promise" by his advisors. Plans to specialize in neurology. Father of one child, another on the way. Yearly income now: \$10,000. Potential life earnings: \$1,149,812. Health insurance? Yes.

Patient #4: Agnes M.

Twenty-six year old mother of two children, abandoned by husband. Unable to work because of lack of day-care facilities in area: presently on welfare. Activities: church, Tenant's Organization in her building, welfare rights organization. Present yearly income: (public aid + food stamps) \$6,996. Potential lifetime earnings: \$121,425. Health insurance? Medicare.

Patient #5: Ellen R.

College junior, 20, suffering from hereditary condition. Doing excellent work in school, has been accepted already for law school. Family fears her twin sister has the same disease. Yearly income now: (Parent's) \$47,000. Potential lifetime earnings: \$928,753. Health insurance? Yes.